

بِسْمِ اللّٰهِ الرَّحْمٰنِ الرَّحِیْمِ

Respectful Imam Ataul Mujeeb Rashid Sahib

اسلام علیکم

I hope by the grace of God you are in good health (Ameen).

You must be aware that my father Mr Abdul Ghani of Croydon and most of my brothers have taken Ba'it at the hand of Mr Abdul Ghaffar Janbah sahib of Germany, who claims to be the Musleh Maud and the Mujaddid of the fifteenth Century. As you can expect, this has left rest of my family to ponder over the claims of Mr Janbah Sahib.

I tried to search the official response to the claims of Mr Janbah Sahib but was very surprised to find out that Jamaat has not responded to him leaving rest of us with one sided arguments. As you can understand that this is a very important issue, I did my own research about the prophecy of Musleh Maud.

My understanding of this prophecy Musleh Maud, as per Tadhkirah, is:

20/02/1886: Pronouncement of the prophecy [Tadhkirah (ed. 2009), p174-179].

22/03/1886: Pronouncement that the Promised son will be born within 9 years [Tadhkirah (ed. 2009), p183].

7/08/1887: Birth of Bashir Awwal: the Promised Messiah (as) calls him the "مولود مسعود" (auspicious son) [Majmua-e-Ishtaharat, vol 1 (Urdu ed. 1971), p141] and later "the lamp of the faith" [Tadhkirah (ed. 2009), p207].

10/07/1888: Pronouncement of birth of another son within a short time whose name will be Mahmud Ahmad and who will prove a person of high resolve in his undertakings [Tadhkirah (ed. 2009), p207].

4/11/1888: Death of Bashir Awwal.

.....1888: a revelation that another son will be granted instead of Bashir Awwal "We shall return him to you out of Our grace" [Tadhkirah (ed. 2009), p209].

1/12/1888: Publication of Green Announcement.

The Subz Ishtihar was written in response to his (as) opponents who claimed that this prophecy is falsified after the death of Bashir Awwal. He (as) explained that Allah has disclosed to him that the prophecy was about 2 boys and hence up to the words: “Blessed is he who comes from heaven” the prophecy relates to Bashir Awwal and rest is related to the second Bashir [Tadhkirah (ed. 2009), p211]. He (as) again pronounced in the Green leaflet that a second Bashir shall be bestowed to me whose name will also be Mahmud [Tadhkirah (ed. 2009), p212].

In summary, the 1st part of the prophecy which relates to a handsome and pure **boy** and who was said to be born from **the Promised Messiah’s (as) own seed and Progeny**, was fulfilled by Bashir Awwal. The second part of the prophecy relates to a virtuous and **pure youth i.e. “Zakki Ghulam”**. The word Boy written in bracket next to “Zakki Ghulam” is not revealed but added by the Promised Messiah (as).

12/01/1889: The second Bashir, who was promised to be given instead of Bashir Awwal, is born.

On the birth of Hazrat Mirza Bashiruddin Mahmud Ahmed, the Promised Messiah (as) said:

“.....as was set out in the Announcement of July 10, 1888 and the Announcement of December 1, 1888—that After the death of Bashir 1st, a second Bashir will be bestowed.....Accordingly, today, Saturday January 12, 1889 a son has been born to this humble one who has for the moment been named Bashir and Mahmud, only by way of good omen. An announcement will be made after full disclosure as I have not yet been given to understand whether this son will grow up and be the Promised Reformer or whether there is some other one.....”

[Tadhkirah (ed. 2009), footnote p212-213].

The Promised Messiah (as) said above that he has **yet** not been given to understand whether this son will grow up and be the Promised Reformer or whether there is some other one but on the other hand, he (as) had already written in the Green Announcement that the second part of the prophecy 20 February relates to the second Bashir.

Imam Sahib, my question is: Was the understanding of the Promised Messiah (as) about the second part of the prophecy relating to the second Bashir Ilhami or his (as) Ijtihad)?

My second question is: Did the Promised Messiah (as) inform us later whether Hazrat Mirza Bashiruddin Mahmud Ahmad is the Promised Reformer or not as he made it very clear at the birth that he would inform this later?

I found your answer in the Rahe-huda 21st February 2010 programme. The link to the **part 3** of the programme is

http://www.youtube.com/view_play_list?p=E9DBE9CC50556C3A

where you said that the Promised Messiah (as) was given full understanding and assurance by Allah the Almighty that Hazrat Mirza Bashiruddin was the Promised son. You gave 3 references from 3 books of the Promised Messiah (as) to prove that the Promised Messiah (as) did inform us later, as promised, that Hazrat Mirza Bashiruddin Mahmud Ahmad is the Promised Son.

First of all you have chosen to give reference from Taryaq-ul-Qulub which was published in October 1902 when all four sons of the Promised Messiah (as) had been born and were alive. You quote:

“The birth of my elder son Mahmud was prophesied in the announcement of July 10,1888 and the announcement of December 1, 1888, which was printed on Green paper..... then by the Grace and Mercy of Allah, Mahmud was born on Saturday 12, 1889.” [Tadhkirah (ed. 2009), footnote p214; *Taryaq-ul-Qulub*, Ruhani Khazain, Vol 15 (Urdu ed. 2008), p219]

Imam Sahib I do not find this reference that you have given as an evidence that the Promised Messiah (as) is declaring Hazrat Mirza Bashiruddin Ahmad as the Promised son and is contradicting with the writings and claims of the Promised Messiah (as) in this same book. Your Reference is on page 219 of Ruhani Khazain. On the opposite page i.e. page 218, Hazrat Promised Messiah (as) referring to his 4th son Hazrat Mirza Mubarak Ahmed wrote:

“After that he was born on 14th June 1899. And as he was my **fourth son**- he was born on the 4th month of the Islamic calendar and 4th day of the week i.e. Wednesday.....and **IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE PROPHECY OF**

20 Feb.1886 his aqiqa was on Monday” [Taryaq-ul-Qulub, Ruhani Khazain, Vol 15 (Urdu ed. 2008), p217-218].

He (as) wrote in the second paragraph of the same page:

“And strange is that when the news of the 4 sons was first told in the announcement of 20th Feb 1886, none of the four sons were yet born. And in the mentioned announcement, God named the fourth son as MUBARAK-look page 3 –Announcement 20 February 1886 second column line 7- so when I named this son Mubarak, then after naming him at once I thought of the prophecy 20 Feb. 1886.” [Taryaq-ul-Qulub, Ruhani Khazain, Vol 15 (Urdu ed. 2008), p218]

On the same page talking about his 4 sons, Hazrat Promised Messiah (as) wrote that Allah the Almighty foretold him before the birth of his each son, about their births and each of these prophecies were published and later were fulfilled. He (as) mentioned this fact again and again in his books as a sign of his truthfulness.

So He (as) wrote from page 219 to 223 from where you have taken your reference (text of your reference is in purple):

“In relation to the birth of four sons the date of the prophecy and the date of the birth is that the birth of my elder son Mahmud was prophesied in the announcement of July 10,1888 and the announcement of December 1, 1888, which was printed on Green paper..... Then by the Grace and Mercy of Allah, Mahmud was born on Saturday 12, 1889.....

And my **second** son whose name is Bashir Ahmed, the prophecy of his birth was written in book Aaina-kamalat-Islam page 266.....

And my **third son** whose name is Sharif Ahmad, the prophecy of his birth is given in the footnote on page 39 of my pamphlet Anwar-ul-Islam.....

And my **fourth son** whose name is **Mubarak**, the prediction regarding him was made in the **proclamation of 20th February 1886** and then in Anjaam-Atham on page 183 on 14th September 1896..... So to affirm my truth and to falsify all my opponents, and to warn Abdul-Haqq

Ghazanvi, God Almighty fulfilled the prophecy concerning the **fourth** son on Wednesday, 14th June 1899 i.e. 4th Safar 1317 (hijri), that is to say that the **Promised/Auspicious Son** was born on that day.” [Taryaq-ul-Qulub, Ruhani Khazain, Vol 15 (Urdu ed. 2008), p219-223]

After reading the context of your reference, it becomes apparent that in the reference you have selected above, the Promised Messiah (as) is only giving the dates when the prophecy about the birth of Hazrat Mirza Bashiruddin Mahmud Ahmad was published and when he was born, as he wrote the same for his other sons including Hazrat Mirza Mubarak Ahmad.

The important thing that I have noted here is how clearly he (as) is relating the prophecy of 20th February 1886 to Hazrat Mirza Mubarak Ahmad and announced him as the Auspicious/Promised Son, whereas, he (as) is relating the Prophecy published on 10 July 1888 and again mentioned in Green Announcement to the birth of Hazrat Mirza Bashiruddin Mahmud Ahmad and not giving even a slight hint of him being the manifestation of the Prophecy 20th February 1886.

The Promised Messiah (as), further elaborated this subject and wrote on page 222 of the same book (and on Page 299 of Rohani Khizian vol 11 re appendix Anjaam-e-Atham):

“Look there was that time when in the **appendix Anjaam-e-Atham** on page 15 this statement was written: there is another revelation which was published on **20 February 1886** and it is this that God **will convert three into four**. At that time the three boys who are present now, did not exist. And the meaning of this revelation was that there will be three boys and then there will be another who will convert three into four. So a major portion of this has been fulfilled, that is to say that Allah bestowed upon me from this marriage, **three sons who all three are present. Only one is awaited who will convert three into four.....**

So gentleman that day has come and the **fourth son** who was promised in these books four times was born on the fourth day of Safar 1317 on Wednesday.....the strange thing is that the figure four is related to this boy from every angle. He was prophesied four times.....he was the

fourth son” [Taryaq-ul-Qulub, Ruhani Khazain, Vol 15 (Urdu ed. 2008), p222-223 – refers to Zamima Risalah Anjaam-e-Atham, Ruhani Khazain, Vol 11 (Urdu ed. 2008), p298-299¹].

On page 146 of the same book he (as) wrote:

“Look! Now a fresh sign is manifested which was mentioned before time on page 58 of appendix Anjaam-e- Atham and that is the statement: “I have constantly been told about a fourth son and we assure Abdul Haq Ghazanvi that he will not die until he hears this prophecy being fulfilled” So Al-Humdulliah on 14 June 1899 on Wednesday that Promised/auspicious son was born and before his birth his three biological brothers had been born and are present. In relation to them, it was described in the prophecy that it is imperative that they are born and then the fourth son is born.his Aqiqa was on Monday. So that prophecy gets fulfilled which was written on a leaflet and published on 20 February 1886 and whose words were these “it is Monday, a blessed Monday” [Taryaq-ul-Qulub, Ruhani Khazain, Vol 15 (Urdu ed. 2008), p146 - refers to Zamima Risalah Anjaam-e-Atham, Ruhani Khazain, Vol 11 (Urdu ed. 2008), p298-299¹].

In the above quoted passages from Appendix Anjaam-e-Atham, which was published in 1897, the Promised Messiah’s (as) three sons were present including Hazrat Mirza Bashiruddin Mahmud Ahmad but he (as) did not call any of them the Promised Reformer instead he (as) proclaimed that God the Almighty will give him a fourth son who will fulfil the prophecy 20 February 1886.

You give your second reference from Siraj-e-Munir (page 36 Ruhani Khazain), which was published in May 1897. You also refer to the 9 year term and that the specific duration (1886-1895) for the Promised Reformer to be born finished 2 years before the publication of this book. I quote your reference with its context and writing in purple shows your quoted text:

¹ There seems to be a typing mistake in Ruhani Khazain, vol 11 on Page 298, where it refers prediction to 1896. Correct year was 1886 (20 February).

“The fifth prophecy was concerning the birth of my son Mahmud that he would be the next to be born and would be named Mahmud. This prophecy was published in the *Sabz Ishtihar* which was distributed in thousands and is still available. That son was born within the term of the prophecy and is in his ninth year.

The sixth prophecy is concerning Sharif who is my third son. And was published in pamphlet *Noor-ul –Huq.....”* [*Siraj-e-Munir, Ruhani Khazain, Vol 12* (Urdu ed. 2008), p36-37].

This reference is similar both in context and words to the reference you gave from *Tarryaq-ul–Quloob* where the Promised Messiah (as) is referring to the fulfilment of the prophecy published on 10 July 1888 and in Green announcement with the Birth of Mahmud.

Imam Sahib I have already quoted above a few references from *Anjam-e-Atham* published also in 1997 where Hazrat Promised Messiah (as) wrote that he has constantly been revealed that a fourth son is going to be born, who he (as) thinks will be the fulfilment of the prophecy *Musleh Maud* by converting three into four.

If you believe in the above reference given by you from *Siraj-e-Munir*, the Promised Messiah (as) referred to Hazrat Mirza Bashiruddin Mahmud Ahmad as being the Promised Reformer then **why there is contradiction between the two books?**

The third reference you give is from *Haqiqatul Wahi* pages 373-374 of Ruhani Khazain and the Promised Messiah (as) wrote this book in the last days of his life (published on 20th April 1907) and I quote this reference with the context: (the writing in purple is the text you quoted in your reference)

“ in the same way when my 1st boy died then the doltish Muslim Scholars and their friends and Christians and Hindus expressed their happiness on his death and they were told again and again that in Prophecy 20 February 1886 there is also a prophecy that some boys would die. So it was must that a boy dies at young age. But still they did not stop from criticising and then Allah the Almighty gave me a glad tiding of another boy. So in page 7 of my Green Announcement there is the glad tidings of

my second boy- Another Bashir shall be given and his another name is Mahmud- although he has up to now that is 1st September 1888, not born but according to the promise of Allah the Almighty, he shall be born within the limit.this is the statement of page 7 of Green Announcement and according to that January 1889 a son was born who was named Mahmud and with the Grace of God is still present and he is in seventeenth year” [Haqiqatul Wahi, Ruhani Khazain, Vol 22 (Urdu ed. 2008), p373-374]

Imam Sahib where in this reference the Promised Messiah has declared Hazrat Mirza Bashiruddin Mahmud Ahmad as the Promised son? Whereas on Page 365 of the same book Hazrat Promised Messiah (as) wrote referring again to page 58 of Anjaam-e-Atham (Appendix Anjaam-e-Atham, page 342 Rohani Khizian vol 11):

“Look at my book Anjaam-e-Atham page 58:- this is the prophecy which was about the birth of my **fourth son** and two and half year after this prophecy in the life of Abdul Haq a fourth son was born who was named **Mubarak** andhe (Abdul Haq) with his imprecations (bud Dua) could not stop the birth of my **PROMISED SON.....**” [Haqiqatul Wahi, Ruhani Khazain, Vol 22 (Urdu ed. 2008), p365 – refers to *Zamima Risalah Anjaam-e-Atham*, Ruhani Khazain, Vol 11 (Urdu ed. 2008), p298-299].

Hazrat Promised Messiah (as) has clearly related the word Promised son for Hazrat Mirza Mubarak Ahmed in Haqiqa-tul-Wahi. Imam Sahib Your reference which is similar in words to your previous 2 references the promised Messiah (as) is explaining, the pronouncing of birth of a second Bashir on 10 July 1888 and in green announcement and then birth of Hazrat Mirza Bashiruddin Mahmud Ahmad accordingly, as one of the sign of his truthfulness.

Imam Sahib! Can you guide me to a reference where the Promised Messiah (as) related Hazrat Mirza Bashiruddin Mahmud Ahmad to the Prophecy 20 Feb 1886 as clearly as he related the prophecy to his fourth son?

There is another confusion that I would like your help with. There was this prophecy revealed in 1896:

“We give you good tidings of a gentle youth, who will be a manifestation of truth and exaltation as if Allah had descended from heaven” [Tadhkirah (ed. 2009), p.358 (Arabic) & p367 (translation); *Risala Dawatul Qom*, Ruhani Khazain, Vol 11 (Urdu ed. 2008), p62].

The Promised Messiah related this prophecy as stated above to his fourth son who he (as) thought was the fulfilment of the Prophecy Musleh Maud. But Allah the Almighty revealed the same prophecy again in 1906 when Hazrat Mirza Mubarak Ahmad was 7 year old.

“We give you good tidings of a youth, who will be a manifestation of truth and exaltation as if Allah had descended from heaven” [Tadhkirah (ed. 2009), p844 (Arabic) & p867 (translation); *Haqiqatul Wahi*, Ruhani Khazain, Vol 22 (Urdu ed. 2008), p98-99].

What message do you think Allah the Almighty was giving to the Promised Messiah and Jamaat by repeating the glad tiding of the Promised Reformer?

We see a year after this Prophecy Hazrat Mirza Mubarak Ahmad died on 16th September 1907 and Allah the Almighty prophesied the Promised Messiah (as) on the same day: “We give you good news of a gentle youth” [Tadhkirah (ed. 2009), p968] and again in Oct 1907: “We give you good news of a gentle youth. **He will look like Mubarak Ahmad**” [Tadhkirah (ed. 2009), p974-975]. Again on 6-7 November 1907 he was prophesied “I give you glad tiding of a pure and righteous youth (Zakki Ghulam)” [Tadhkirah (ed. 2009), p981].

It seems to me that just like the 1st part of the prophecy which was fulfilled by Bashir Awwal and after his death Allah bestowed the Promised Messiah (as) the second Bashir whom the qualities of Bashir Awwal were transferred.

In the same way Allah bestowed the Promised Messiah (as) the fourth son who he (as) thought was the fulfilment of the second part of the prophecy 20 Feb 1886. But Allah the Almighty called Hazrat Mirza Mubarak Ahmad back and instead promised to give him another

“ghulam” (youth) who will be like Mubarak i.e. the qualities of Mubarak (those described in Prophecy 20 February 1886) will be manifested in him. This is also what the Promised Messiah (as) saw in one of his dream in September 1907 just before the death of Mirza Mubarak Ahmed:

“I saw a pit full of water in my dream. Miyan Mubarak Ahmad entered into it and was drowned. A thorough search was made but no trace of him was found. Then I walked along and saw another boy sitting in his stead” [Tadhkirah (ed. 2009), p967].

I understand that the above prophecies revealed before and after the death of Hazrat Mirza Mubarak Ahmad are with reference to the Promised Reformer as similar to the Prophecy 20 Feb 1886, the word ‘Ghulam’/youth is used along with the promised qualities of the Promised Reformer i.e. ‘Zakki’/pure, ‘Haleem’/gentle and **manifestation of truth and exaltation as if Allah had descended from heaven.**

It appears to me that by revealing the glad tidings of the Promised Reformer from time to time until 1907 Allah the Almighty was indirectly telling the Promised Messiah (as) that the Zakki ghulam or the Promised Reformer was not going to be from his biological progeny.

Imam Sahib the Promised Messiah (as) did not have any more children after Hazrat Mirza Mubarak Ahmad then **who is the bearer of those glad tidings?**

If as per our belief Hazrat Mirza Bashiruddin Mahmud Ahmad was the Promised Reformer then **why Allah the Almighty kept giving glad tidings of a Promised Reformer after his birth that is after 12 January 1889?**

How do you explain this prophecy revealed to the Promised Messiah (as) on 13 April 1899 when Hazrat Mirza Bashiruddin Mahmud Ahmad was nine year old:

“**Wait a short while, I shall soon bestow on you a pure youth**” [Tadhkirah (ed. 2009), p433].

Imam Sahib my limited understanding of the Quran tells me that when glad tidings of a ghulam was given to Hazrat Ibrahim (as), Hazrat

Zakkariya (as) and Hazrat Maryam (as), the bearers of glad tidings that is Hazrat Ismail (as), Hazrat Yayah (as) and Hazrat Isa (as) respectively were born after the glad tidings, i.e. Promised sons were not present or yet born at the time of the glad tidings. Therefore, in the light of my understanding of Quran, the Promised son of the Promised Messiah (as) or the replacement of Mubarak was to be born after 1907.

Imam Sahib! Can you kindly give me a reference from Quran where a glad tidings of a son is given to a person or a Prophet and that Promised son was already born i.e. present at the time of the glad tidings? I believe that this reference from Quran is essential if we want to defend the claim of Hazrat Mirza Bashiruddin Mahmud Ahmad as the Promised Reformer.

Imam Sahib you further said on this topic that:

It is wrong to imagine about this prophecy that He will be born later because Allah has appointed a specific limit for his birth and that duration is of nine year.....

My question is If Allah the Almighty appointed a nine year limit for this Promised Son to be born then **why the Promised Messiah (as) clearly declared, again and again, his fourth son Hazrat Mirza Mubarak Ahmad as the Promised Son who was born in 1899, that is to Say, thirteen years after the Prophecy 20 February 1886 and four years after the expiry of nine year limit?**

Why was Allah the Almighty kept giving the Promised Messiah (as) glad tidings of a youth "ghulam" with the same qualities as mentioned in the Prophecy Musleh Maud until 1907, that is twenty one years after the Prophecy 20 Feb 1886 and 12 years after the expiry of nine year limit?

My explanation is that the prophecy relating to nine year limit was on 22nd March 1886 and at that time the prophecy was thought to be about one son. It is possible that Allah the Almighty told the Promised Messiah (as) that the Promised son, who is promised in the 1st part of the prophecy and was going to die at an early age, was to be born within nine year period. So the births of Bashir Awwal and even his

replacement i.e. Bashir second (Hazrat Mirza Bashiruddin Mahmud Ahmed) was within nine years of the Prophecy 20th February 1886.

I request you Imam Sahib to guide me if you think that my understanding of the Prophecy Musleh Maud is incorrect. I am at a very critical point of my life. I see myself standing at that point, where Bani Israel were standing at the time of appearance of Hazrat Isa (as), where Arabs were standing when the Prophet Muhammad (peace and blessings of Allah be Upon him) declared his Nabuwat and where Ummat-e-Muslima was standing when the Promised Messiah (as) declared his status.

والسلام

Dr Mansoor Arshad